30304



THE SPECIAL COURT FOR SIERRA LEONE

Trial Chamber II

Before:

Justice Julia Sebutinde, Presiding

Justice Richard Lussick, Justice Teresa Doherty,

Justice El Hadji Malick Sow, Alternate

Registrar:

Ms. Binta Mansaray

Date:

24 September 2010

Case No.:

SCSL-03-01-T

THE PROSECUTOR

--V--

CHARLES GHANKAY TAYLOR

RECEIVED COURT MANAGEMENT
2.4 SEP 2010
NAME ALMASSAW PORMAH
SIGN
TIME 16:57

PUBLIC WITH ANNEX A

DEFENCE MOTION FOR ADMISSION OF DOCUMENTS PURSUANT TO RULE 92bis – NEWSPAPER ARTICLE

Office of the Prosecutor:

Ms. Brenda J. Hollis

Counsel for the Accused:

Mr. Courtenay Griffiths, Q.C.

Mr. Terry Munyard Mr. Morris Anyah

Mr. Silas Chekera

Mr. James Supuwood

I. INTRODUCTION

- 1. This is the Defence motion to admit into evidence the annexed documents, pursuant to Rules 92bis of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence of the Special Court for Sierra Leone ("Rules").
- 2. The proposed material is relevant to the proceedings; in particular to the allegation put forward by Prosecution that the Accused was involved in diamond-dealings in exchange for arms and ammunition.
- 3. The document annexed to this motion is a Sunday Times newspaper article dated 19 September 2010 and entitled "Taylor a victim of 'neo-colonial' conspiracy".

II. APPLICABLE LAW

4. Rule 92bis states:

- (A) In addition to the provision of Rule 92ter, a Chamber may, in lieu of oral testimony, admit as evidence in whole or in part, information including written statements and transcripts, that do not go to proof of the acts and conduct of the accused.
- (B) The information submitted may be received in evidence if, in the view of the Trial Chamber, it is relevant to the purpose for which it is submitted and if its reliability is susceptible of confirmation.
- (C) A party wishing to submit information as evidence shall give 10 days notice to the opposing party. Objections, if any, must be submitted within 5 days.
- 5. Trial Chamber II has ruled that the purpose of Rule 92bis is to permit the reception of information—assertions of fact (but not opinion) including, but not limited to, written statements and transcripts that do not go to proof of the acts and conduct of the accused—if such facts are relevant and their reliability is "susceptible to confirmation." However, the reliability of a document is not a bar

-

¹ Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-T-556, "Decision on Prosecution Notice Under Rule 92bis for the Admission of Evidence Related to Inter Alia Kenema District and on Prosecution Notice Under Rule 92bis for the Admission of the Prior Testimony of TF1-036 Into Evidence", 15 July 2008, page 4.

- to admission; information may still be admitted where it is capable of corroboration in due course.²
- 6. The Appeals Chamber of the Special Court for Sierra Leone has ruled that any information not going to proof of the acts and conduct of the accused which is *not tendered through a witness* [emphasis added] should be submitted under Rule 92bis.³ Furthermore, the Appeals Chamber has found that by its express terms Rule 92bis applies to information tendered "in lieu of oral testimony" and the information to be admitted is *not restricted to written statements or transcripts* [emphasis added]. ⁴

III. SUBMISSIONS AND ADMISSIBILITY OF EVIDENCE

- 7. Defence Exhibit DCT-463⁵, Sunday Times Newspaper Article dated 19 September 2010, is relevant to the proceedings. The Defence submits only the identified paragraphs (the last three paragraphs) of the article pursuant to Rule92*bis*.
- 8. The three paragraphs are as follows:

⁵ Annex A

SCSL-03-01

² Prosecutor v. Norman et al., SCSL-2004-14-AR73, "Fofana – Decision on Appeal against 'Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence", 16 May 2005, para. 26. In the AFRC trial, the Trial Chamber has stated that "evidence may be excluded because it is unreliable, but it is not necessary to demonstrate the reliability of the evidence before it is admitted." See Prosecutor v. Brima et al., SCSL-04-16-T, "Decision on Prosecution Tender for Admission into Evidence of Information Contained in Notice Pursuant to Rule 92bis", 18 November 2005, page 2, citing Prosecutor v. Brima et al., SCSL-04-16-T, "Decision on Joint Defence Application for Leave to Appeal from Decision n Defence Motion to Exclude All Evidence from Witness TF1-277", 2 August 2005, para. 6. In the same AFRC trial, the Trial Chamber considered the reliability of the evidence to be considered at the end of the trial and be evaluated and weighed as a whole, taking into account the context and nature of the evidence as well as the credibility and reliability of the evidence See: Prosecutor v. Brima et al., SCSL-04-16-T, "Decision on Prosecution Tender for Admission into Evidence of Information Contained in Notice Pursuant to Rule 92bis", 18 November 2005, page 2. See also: Prosecutor v. Norman et al., SCSL-04-14-T-447, "Decision on Prosecution's Request to Admit into Evidence Certain Documents Pursuant to Rule 92bis and 89(C)", 14 July 2005, page 3.

³ Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-721 "Decision on 'Prosecution Notice of Appeal and Submissions Concerning the Decision Regarding the Tender of Documents", 6 February 2009, para. 34.

⁴ Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-721, para 30-31. Subsequent to the Appeals Chamber Decision, Trial Chamber II found that: "The effect of Rule 92bis is to permit the reception of information-assertions of fact (but not opinion) including, but not limited to, written statements and transcripts that do not go to proof of the acts and conduct of the accused- if such facts are relevant and their reliability is "susceptible of confirmation"; proof of reliability is not a condition of admission: all that is required is that the information should be capable of corroboration in due course."

"The National Conventional Arms Control Committee authorises arms by government and South African arms manufacturers. The committee has in the past been criticised by organisations like Ceasefire for selling weapons to countries with sketchy human rights records, and for failing to keep a proper database of where South-African-made arms eventually end up.

This week, Justice Minister Jeff Radebe, who heads the committee, denied the country or its arms manufacturers had ever done business with Taylor.

Ministerial spokesperson Tlali Tlali said the committee's records reflected there were 'no applications for issuance of contracting or export permits' on behalf of either Taylor government [sic], Liberia or the RUF."

The Evidence is Relevant

- 9. The issue of Mr. Taylor's travel to South Africa in order to purchase arms is one of the central issues of the Prosecution's case. On 9 August 2010, the Prosecution opened their case on 9 August 2010 and brought 3 (three) additional witnesses to testify on the Accused's trip to South Africa in 1997. This was done in order to support Prosecution allegations that the Accused used rough diamonds for personal enrichment and arm purchases for Sierra Leone, particularly during the AFRC/RUF period.
- 10. Furthermore, Prosecution Expert Witness Dr. Stephen Ellis in direct examination stated that he believed that Mr. Taylor personally supervised the trade in diamonds from Sierra Leone to Liberia; had contractual relationship with military operatives from South Africa and elsewhere who were acting in support of the RUF; and facilitated the import of weapons, some of which appear to have been transmitted to the RUF to aid the latter's war effort.⁸
- 11. It is, therefore, self-evident that the information contained in the newspaper articles, in particular the two paragraphs identified above, attached to this motion (DCT-463) is relevant to this proceeding, in particular to the allegations made against the Accused and satisfied the test of relevance set out in Rule 92bis of the Rules.

-

⁶ Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-T-962, "Public with Confidential Annexes A and B Prosecution Motion to Call Three Addition Witnesses", 20 May 2010, para.2.

⁸ Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-T, Trial Transcript, 16 January 2008, p. 1448, ln. 15-26.

The Evidence is Susceptible of Confirmation

12. Rule 92*bis* also requires the material(s) referred to in this notice to be susceptible of confirmation. The Defence, at this point in time, is only required to show that the reliability of the evidence is susceptible to confirmation and does not have to prove that the evidence is actually reliable. The Appeals Chamber in *Norman et al* has further interpreted that "susceptible of confirmation" does not require proof of reliability before admission, but does require that the information is capable of corroboration in due course. This Trial Chamber has noted that reliability is to be assessed at the end of the trial, in light of the totality of the evidence presented at trial, and what weight, if any, and should be attached to it. The Defence submits that the issue is not novel to the Prosecution and has been corroborated by Prosecution's witnesses as mentioned and referred to above.

The Evidence Does Not Go to Proof of the Acts and Conduct of the Accused

13. The Defence acknowledges that Rule 92bis explicitly excludes written statements or transcripts which go to proof of the acts and conduct of the Accused. The Defence submits that the paragraphs submitted here do not go to proof of the acts and conduct of the Accused and merely focus on the South African arms authorisation, and thus satisfy the requirements of admission through Rule 92bis.

_

⁹ Prosecutor v. Norman et al., SCSL-2004-14-AR73, "Fofana – Decision on Appeal against 'Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence", 16 May 2005, para. 27.

¹⁰ Prosecutor v. Norman et al., SCSL-2004-14-AR73, "Fofana – Decision on Appeal against 'Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence", 16 May 2005, para. 26.

¹¹ Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-750, "Decision on Prosecution Motion for Admission of

Newspaper Articles Obtained from the Catholic Justice and Peace Commission Archive in Monrovia, Liberia"27 February 2009, paragraph 27 quoting so and so.

There is a distinction between "the acts and conduct of those others who commit the crimes for which the Indictment alleges that the accused is individually responsible" and "the acts and conduct of the accused as charged in the Indictment which establish his responsibility for the acts and conduct of others;" and that only written statements which go to proof of the latter are excluded by Rule 92bis. See: Prosecutor v. Galic, IT-98-29-AR73.2, "Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Concerning Rule 92bis(C)", 8 June 2002, para. 9. See also Prosecutor v. Sesay et al., SCSL-04-15-1049, "Decision on Defence Application for the Admission of the Witness Statement of DIS-192 Under Rule 92bis or, in the alternative, Under Rule 92ter", 12 March 2008, p.2-3., See also Prosecutor v. Galic, IT-98-29-AR73.2, "Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Concerning Rule 92bis(C)", 8 June 2002, para. 9.

IV. CONCLUSION

14. For the reasons stated above, the Defence respectfully requests the Trial Chamber, in exercising its discretion, to admit into evidence, pursuant to Rule 92*bis*, the newspaper article annexed to this motion.

Respectfully Submitted,

Courtenay Griffiths, Q.C.

Lead Counsel for Charles G. Taylor Dated this 24^{th Day} of September 2010

The Hague, The Netherlands

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Prosecutor v Taylor

Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-T-556, "Decision on Prosecution Notice Under Rule 92bis for the Admission of Evidence Related to Inter Alia Kenema District and on Prosecution Notice Under Rule 92bis for the Admission of the Prior Testimony of TF1-036 Into Evidence", 15 July 2008.

Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-721, "Decision on 'Prosecution Notice of Appeal and Submissions Concerning the Decision Regarding the Tender of Documents", 6 February 2009.

Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-750, "Decision on Prosecution Motion for Admission of Newspaper Articles Obtained from the Catholic Justice and Peace Commission Archive in Monrovia, Liberia", 27 February 2009.

Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-T-962, "Public with Confidential Annexes A and B Prosecution Motion to Call Three Addition Witnesses", 20 May 2010.

Prosecutor v. Taylor, SCSL-03-01-T, Trial Transcript, 16 January 2008

CDF

Prosecutor v. Norman et al., SCSL-2004-14-AR73, "Fofana – Decision on Appeal against 'Decision on Prosecution's Motion for Judicial Notice and Admission of Evidence", 16 May 2005.

Prosecutor v. Norman et al., SCSL-04-14-T-447, "Decision on Prosecution's Request to Admit into Evidence Certain Documents Pursuant to Rule 92bis and 89(C)", 14 July 2005.

AFRC

Prosecutor v. Brima et al., SCSL-04-16-T, "Decision on Joint Defence Application for Leave to Appeal from Decision n Defence Motion to Exclude All Evidence from Witness TF1-277", 2 August 2005.

Prosecutor v. Brima et al., SCSL-04-16-T, "Decision on Prosecution Tender for Admission into Evidence of Information Contained in Notice Pursuant to Rule 92bis", 18 November 2005.

RUF

Prosecutor v. Sesay et al., SCSL-04-15-1049, "Decision on Defence Application for the Admission of the Witness Statement of DIS-192 Under Rule 92bis or, in the alternative, Under Rule 92ter", 12 March 2008.

ICTY

Prosecutor v. Galic, IT-98-29-AR73.2, "Decision on Interlocutory Appeal Concerning Rule 92bis(C)", 7 June 2002.

 $\frac{http://sim.law.uu.nl/sim/caselaw/tribunalen.nsf/eea9364f4188dcc0c12571b500379d39}{a2755cfb491f7363c12571fe004be529/\$FILE/Galic%20ACD%207-06-2002.pdf}$

ANNEX A

union service conduction of the conduction of th

3

We don't want to write to fall. We want excellent results even if it means we are arrested and jailed for our rights

Corpress of St Students general storiary Should Sheat, following

Capeton

owns stake in sweat

Union is accused of hypocrisy as local firms shed workers

ANNA-MARIA LOMBARD

The South African Clothing and Tearlie Workers' Union's (Saction's) wa's role is enforcing infilmum wates while it is heavily freezhol in e company that operates in Letotho's los-wage economy has

incident of permission of the line and hundreds of fectories might close as a result of the Clothin Manufacturing Surgaining Council enforcing minimum pay agree of enforcing minimum pay agree

outing the continuous and compliance and it has called for properations.

Pashion concernist and masky benefit before being of The Relieus Consulpiner, said that Sactrouses.

Tr owns shares in Searchej, a r of manufacturer which has be

Rivel said that the investment worth around Rago million, who no one also was prepared to inveshad haved john. Clothing was established by the previous desardel management prior to the talenove, so factive can not be accused of betraying local color—"and Kigal.

The pays above the legal minimum wage and complete with all other Leeothe before less, Our role, together with now Leeothe own role, together with one Leeothe who was a feature one agentle for decent work in southern white in the advance one agentle for decent work in southern Arich including in Leeother Krief suit that "Affirch in the suit of the the suit of

Kiel said that "dimhishing volumes are been glocal demanded by retail customers and oustomer from prepetrated by importers were causing Seardel's Organism struggles. The company amountsed in july that another division, infimise (a)

ding another 800 jobs.

Patients at the Chris Hani Baragwanath Hospital stand in long queues for medication. Some of them come from as far away as Sebokeng and surrounding areas, When City Press visited Bara Phamacy there were patients who had been in queues since 4am. Most had been turned away from their own clinics and told to go to Bara to get their medication. The CEO of Bara, Johanna More, said they were overloaded and told many to return to their community clinics.

Taylor a victim of 'neo-colonial conspira retailers importing cheap products were making it impossible to mercat. To an outsider it looks like that Sactwu, through its 40% share in invest-

The division was likely to close by year-end.

Deetlafs defended the parjaining process as "sincere" and said there were too many role players on the council for any one to influence the The Bargaining Council's Leor direction of decisions.

dated invernent (HCI), which owns 71% of Seardel, owns the subdidays, wenne Clothing in

Lesotho

ment company Hosken Consoli

hypocrisy," Palmi said. He explained that

Coastu's provingial secretary in the Free State, Sam Mashinin, recently described wages in

Wages

"A South African worker should earn Ri 296 a month, white the

Lesotho as "pitiable".

minimum wage in Lesotho is between R650 and R710 a month.

depending on the job. That is no

on," Mashirini said.

KHADIJA BRADLOW thadija bradiow@citypress.co.za

> had shifted production to Leaptho and more factories would be forced to do so not only because of pay, Alan Jarvis, chief executive di rector of Tem Sportsweer, a divi-sion of Formosa Holdings, said it but also productivity.

Charles Taylor's lawyer, a household name since his grilling earlier this month of supermodel Naomi

Campbell on the witness stand. wishes that his client's trial had in-stead been on South African soil. This to avoid the unfortunate resultant's imagery of a black African men being taken to Bu-

> exiland to take advantage of her labour costs to compensate schini Group moved its business to Sartler this year the massive Fo for a strop in sales during the rapes

> > Seardel CEO Strart Queen said NyeNye's employees in Lesotho represented less than 5% of the

Jarvis and the government inte-socho was supportive and the th-for had engaged in abop-door negotiations.

Through investment company HCI it had rescued the Searcle group from getting. The following close is being close down alto-getther; and Search chairperson

from the 15 000 Section

000001

had sought to preserve.

portedly dropped to just above

group's labour force, which had re

mum is Rido a week, whereas in South Africa the same job would In Lesotho no one pays below the minimum wave - but that minipay R460 # week

ness Programme, which has no duction incentive that is an improving competitive that South Africa as well as attents. Trade and inclusity Minister Rob Davice this week launched the Clothing and Textile Comp

Sactivu general secretary Andre

be profitable in the future made it

In Copelyn the general view in the minds with the textiles might not

John Cop

elphouring Sterra Legne. With

weapons, the Revolutionaky

(RUP)

engaged in an ii-year campaign of the control of th the severing of limbs. Tons of things. The RUP's calling cand, portrayed in many books and pentaries about the way, was KIII of thousands were k mutilated in the war. But the morality

International criminal justice today is motivated by politics and the point of why he accepted the brief, says Oriffiths.

power," he says,
Although it has not been raised
in the trial and no supporting evidence could be produced, Grifs client. Griffiths is in South Africa on a politics and power, and not moral-ity, are behind the prosecution of ropeinchains. His lawyer, Courte-nay Griffithi QC, believes race, spirited public relations drive to convince the world his client is the ed to apply a double standard

 neo-colonial conspiracy to unseat him because he refused to fiths claims Taylor is the victim of allow US-backed companies to also suggests racism is exploit Liberia's oil weighth beating Thylor's prosecution. Griffiths lambasted the international Criminal Court (ICC) for what he like Sudanese President Onar ing indictments of African leaders al-Bashir, but not against former US president George W Bush and terms/selective prosecution-

> And he wants to probe the South The trial does not relate to any out a trial that the trial trial

dricen link to Taylor.

Actim of shadowy forces deter-

former British prime minister Teny Blair for what many have abelled war crimes committed in Irad and Afghanistan.

though WN sanctioned, loss not during his visit in 1997. ICC, widely halled as setting a The special court was initially convened in Freetown but nowed to The Hague in 2007/ amid new standard of "accountability Court concerns. The/ for atroctty' security

It was as a newly elected president that Charles Taylor first bell at The Hague once again threw a spotlight on the South The indictments make beforence several times to the involvement visited South Africa in 1997 and hosted by Nelson Mandela, where attended the nowfinfamous dinner diamonds are alleged to have exchanged hands The testinony of Roomi Camp African connection to the trial of former South African S Forces fighters in both. Leogle's civil war. bell at The Hague so-called blood

from power in 2001.

He also plant to partie explore the "blood danaged "expection since it is control to the present tion's claim. that Traying exchanged the genus for a min.

to countries with slietchy human rights records, and for failing to keep a profiler distance of where South African-mode arms eventuers. The committee has in the past been criticised by organisations like Ceaseffre for selling weapons National Conventional ises arms by government and Arms Control Committee author South Africato arms manufactur ally end up

This week, justice Minister Jeff tee, detried the country of its arms Radebe, who heads the control

៦ what happened in Sierra Lebne is not

Charles Taylor's lawyer Courtenay Griffiths || PHOTO: MUNITU VILAKAS

government, Liberts or the RUF And Griffiths now wants to question South African autheri-ties about the claim made by the rosecution that former president

Telephones 011 644 9800 E-made into@rafe.co.cs Funding is made available via intermediantes to end-users' whose footselvoid income ranges from R1 500 to R15 000 for loans, usually of between R1 000' and R20 000. The end-user Fund any form of use relating to housing that is permanent (not furnishing, etc.) the NHFC target market. Access to home loans is increased and delivered through the branch 3. Incremental Housing: WGENS; Hame Ownership is achieved through the provision of mortgage bonds for either buying an existing home or building one. receive any subsidies or grents. It does cater, however, for the affordable markets. This also includes liner city rental developments. NHFC provides loans to non-banking retail intermediaries, who on-lend to households in Through co-financing and risk-entrancems mechanisms, banks' lending in this segment the market is increased and outtained. waking Rotall Inturn Partnership with Banks 2. Home Ownership ernment and capital sacrament and capital sacrament and capital sacramede available for the rich of Human Settlements. achieves for mandate through the . This type of rental accommodation is more of wholessie financing of the three efforts also than, privates/commercial quality options for householder. Exceminations and its provided by social householders, which are Section 21. This entails the provision of loans to provided by private landords who de not Institutions that provide various housing tenurs options other than ownership. The types of rental products are as follows: Social Mousing Rental Privata Rent range is RI 500 - RIS 000 and are South African on its depends on the A. Kental housing: B. Home ownership through mortgage; C. Incremental housing. The choice of the option dependention of the choice outlines affordsoutly at the time. To be this leader in the development of the low 1. Rental House to middle income housing market NHFC's. Target Market Households whose income This entails th 8 if of Housing as a Development Stitution (DFT) in 1996, with the mandate or broadening and access to affordable housing the tow middle income South NATIONAL HOUSING FINANCE CORPORATION (NHFC) - Innovator, Financier, Excilitator Finance Corporations of by the National The Nac (NHPC) Departm

City Press | 19 September 2010